36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

48

49

50

51

52

53

55

56

57

58

59

61

60 L

54

Maternal Health in Nepal and Other Low-Income Countries: Causes, Contexts, and Future Directions

Jan Brunson

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

One longstanding challenge to improving maternal health in low-income countries has been the lack of access to skilled care during antenatal, birth, and postnatal periods. Problems of access can be attributed to a multitude of factors related to disadvantaged governments and economies, such as the lack of infrastructure including roads and hospitals, but also inequitable social hierarchies based on wealth, gender, and ethnicity or religion. Exceptional circumstances of war, political unrest, and natural disasters exacerbate these conditions. After the Millennium Development Goals have come and gone, what novel themes are emerging from research on maternal health in low-income countries? Using examples from over a decade of my field research in Nepal, as well as others from around the globe, I identify several important debates of particular relevance to future research in gender and demography on maternal health in the global South. I analyze the current and future directions in studies of maternal health in low-income countries such as Nepal, identifying three formidable challenges to achieving further declines in maternal mortality ratios in the future. I conclude by arguing that as demography's hyperfocus on fertility rates declines in conjunction with declining population growth rates around the globe, demographers are

J. Brunson (⊠) Department of Anthropology, University of Hawai'i, Honolulu, HI, USA

e-mail: jbrunson@hawaii.edu

ideally positioned to contribute more significantly to studies of women beyond the topic of how many offspring they produce – a more holistic consideration of women's experiences of reproduction (or lack thereof) and their relation to demographic characteristics such as wealth and ethnicity.

10.1 Background

Much of the research on maternal health originates and resides, in terms of scholarly disciplines, in public health or global health. These fields specialize in analyzing the biological and social determinants of maternal health in an empirical fashion, quantifying progress or decline at the population level, which is easily translated into policy. Sociology and anthropology utilize a wider variety of theoretical perspectives, including post-structuralist and critical ones, to examine similar topics from more holistic, more political, and sometimes less quantitative and empirical, ways (Scheper-Hughes 1997; Riley and McCarthy 2003). The resulting forms of data that such approaches create are less effective at generalizing at the population level. People's narratives, local systems of logic, and other forms of qualitative data are less easily translated into policy (Justice 1989). While studies of maternal health in anthropology may not use the universalizing analytical domain of "maternal health,"

113

114

115

117

118

119

120

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

preferring to avoid treating "the people being studied as objects whose behavior is rendered into the western observer's already existing categories" (Kertzer and Fricke 1997:2), recent decades have produced a rich canon of ethnographies on various aspects of reproduction, gender, and well-being.

63

64

65

66

67

68 69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

In its nascent stages, scholarly investigation into the domain of maternal health at the population level was dominated by public health. However, in the 1980s, Rosenfield and Maine pointed out that public health research on maternal and child health tended to focus on infants and children and not on the mothers. Their seminal article on public health's paucity of attention to maternal mortality (Rosenfield and Maine 1985), in which they queried, "Where is the M in MCH?" was a call to action in the field of what was then called "maternal and child health" (MCH). Policymakers at that time thought it was more feasible to reduce child mortality through preventative measures such as immunization, oral rehydration, and breastfeeding, than to provide pregnant women with expensive and hightech lifesaving medical care at hospitals (Rosenfield et al. 2007). Spotlighting the number of women dying each year, the Safe Motherhood Conference in Nairobi launched a global initiative to reduce maternal mortality in low-income countries in 1987.

Tracking progress in maternal mortality rates in low-income countries is challenging for reasons with which demographers are quite familiar: vital registration systems in rural areas are often deficient, and surveys produce estimates with varying margins of uncertainty. By most accounts, however, progress in reducing maternal mortality has been slow. The vast majority of maternal deaths in low-income countries are due to direct obstetrical complications, including hemorrhage, infection, eclampsia, obstructed labor, and unsafe abortion (Rosenfield et al. 2007). Moreover, maternal deaths are only one part of the larger picture of maternal morbidity. Many injuries related to pregnancy and childbirth are disabling, such as obstetrical fistula and uterine prolapse, and have long-term impacts on women's wellbeing and productivity. Accurate accounting of such morbidities is even more difficult to obtain than that for maternal deaths due to stigma or lack or reporting.

The Safe Motherhood Initiative, launched in 1987, initially emphasized improving antenatal care, including screening for risk factors, and on training birth attendants to use safe, hygienic practices. However, many obstetrical complications cannot be predicted or prevented. Screening can identify women with certain risk factors, but the majority of obstetrical complications occur in women categorized as low risk. Most births in high-mortality settings take place at home, and even trained attendants can only do so much to save women's lives when obstetrical emergencies occur (Rosenfield et al. 2007). These observations regarding the ineffectiveness of identifying during pregnancy who would need hospitalization at birth led to a shift in focus away from strategies that concentrated on the antenatal period to strategies that ensure that women have access to emergency obstetrical care at the time of birth.1

Recognition of the importance of referral systems in reducing maternal mortality in low-income countries developed out of acknowledging that obstetric emergencies are often difficult to predict and that births in low-income countries occur at home for a variety of reasons. Maternal and neonatal deaths could therefore be prevented if a functional referral system were in place to allow women to reach appropriate health services when complications occur (Hussein et al. 2012). Thaddeus and Maine's three delays model (1994) provided a conceptual framework of the factors influencing a timely arrival to a medical care facility in an obstetric emergency. The three delays are (1) delays in the recognition of the

¹However, it is interesting to note that a recent surge in interest and knowledge of epigenetics has brought pregnancy back into the spotlight in high-income countries, as biomedical researchers begin to learn the extent to which the prenatal environment impacts fetal and child development. In this scenario, ironically the focus shifts back to the fetus and away from the mother, who becomes the vessel for the fetus and whose own rights and desires become secondary to developing the ideal conditions for the fetus/future child.

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

196

<u>AU</u>β95

problem and the decision to seek care in the household, (2) delays in reaching the appropriate facility, and (3) delays in the care received once the woman reaches the facility. The three delays are interrelated, and interventions aimed at one delay may result in improvements in another. Programs that aim to improve referral systems build and upgrade rural health centers and attempt to stock them consistently with necessary supplies and equipment. They make efforts to train community health workers as well as ensure that rural health posts and hospitals are adequately staffed with doctors and nurses. And since a functioning referral system includes transport, programs aim to ensure adequate transport between facilities, as well. The three delays model continues to be highly useful for research on improving birth outcomes in low-income countries.

Over time, the scope of what constitutes safer motherhood has widened considerably. A major factor was the incorporation of a human rights approach into the definition of Safe Motherhood following the agenda set at the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD) in 1994. By defining maternal death as social injustice, programs for "safer motherhood" invoked a much broader range of political, social, and economic initiatives than was previously possible (UNFPA et al. 1997). Lists of relevant health risks included poor nutrition, illiteracy, lack of income and employment opportunities, inadequate health and family planning services, and low social status. Hussein has argued, in fact, that the burgeoning of safer motherhood messages has, in some cases, led to confusion at the programmatic and implementation levels in places like Nepal (Hussein and Clapham 2005).

Much has changed since Rosenfield and Maine's 1985 call for a focus on the "M" in MCH. For the past three decades, improving maternal health has been high on the global development agenda. One of the eight United Nations Millennium Development Goals established in 2000 was to reduce the maternal mortality ratio by 75% by 2015. Between 1990 and 2015, maternal mortality worldwide dropped about 44% (Alkema et al. 2015). Of the 95 countries with high levels of maternal mortality in 1990, 9 countries achieved MDG 5A, and another 39 countries made significant progress.

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

214

215

216

217

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

227

228

229

230

231

232

233

While progress has been made, approximately 303,000 women died in 2015 during and following pregnancy and childbirth. Almost all of these deaths occurred in low-resource settings, and most could have prevented (Alkema et al. 2015). Almost all maternal deaths (99%) occurred in developing countries. More than half of those deaths occurred in sub-Saharan Africa, and almost one third occurred in South Asia (WHO 2016). Wide disparities in maternal mortality also exist within countries, in association with dimensions of social advantage such as wealth and with rural residence.

10.2 **Context of the Research**

In the case of Nepal, the recently released 2016 Nepal Demographic and Health Survey shows (Ministry of Health 2017) that pregnancy-related maternal mortality ratios² dropped notably in the time between the 1996 and 2006 surveys,³ but the decline has stalled between the 2006 and 2016 surveys. In the 2016 NDHS, the pregnancyrelated mortality ratio is estimated as 259 (CI: 151-366) compared to 281 (CI: 178-384) in 2006. The confidence intervals for the 2006 and 2016 ratios overlap substantially. This newly released data must be causing some disappointment throughout the development community and those working to further reduce maternal mortality ratios.

The broader context of achieving lower maternal mortality ratios in Nepal involves a consideration of several facts, first and foremost that 41% of births are delivered at home (Ministry of Health 2017). In a nation that has a strong referral system and near universal attendance of birth by

²The definition of maternal mortality has changed in the 2016 NDHS, and the new definition now excludes deaths from accidents or violence. Current estimates are not directly comparable to prior estimates, which are essentially pregnancy-related mortality ratios. Therefore, I use pregnancy-related mortality ratios in order to use a consistent measurement that can be compared over time.

³See Hussein et al. (2011) for an appraisal of this decline.

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302

303

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

323

324

325

326

328

329

330

331

a skilled provider, that statistic would cause no concern. But in Nepal, only 58% of births are assisted by a skilled provider, and one in ten births are assisted by no one (Ministry of Health 2017). In a key country-level study conducted in 2008, the direct leading causes of maternal death in Nepal were hemorrhage (24%), hypertensive disorders (21%), and complications related to abortion (7%) (Suvedi et al. 2009). Indirect causes included limited health literacy across Nepal, weak health systems, and lack of facilities (Suvedi et al. 2009). For Nepalis who do not live in urban centers, roughly 80% of the population, sub-health posts, health posts, and primary healthcare centers are the only facilities available. These facilities qualify for the official label "birthing centers" in Nepal, which means they are staffed mostly with locally recruited staff nurses, auxiliary nurse midwives, and maternal child health workers. They are equipped to assist only normal institutional or home births (Suvedi et al. 2009). Thus, for most of the country's population, in rural areas with only birthing centers, many challenges to establishing a functioning referral system remain, including the most obvious for remote settings: adequate transportation and infrastructure that make transferal to a better equipped and staffed facility possible.

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250

251

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

The intermittent periods of ethnographic research that I describe in this chapter focus on a semi-urban community on the edge of the Kathmandu Valley, where a hospital is quickly reached by taxi, or by bus in under 30 min, and a health post is in walking distance. In this location, with these facilities and services available, I found that there were still women giving birth unassisted by a skilled provider, and even some giving birth alone (Brunson 2010). I also discovered that typically families did not utilize what was then a sub-health post (upgraded to a health post in 2014) for antenatal or delivery assistance; rather, when they did seek care, they preferred the teaching hospital located a few kilometers further down the road towards Kathmandu (Brunson 2010). Families in this community typically had two or three children, a shift in comparison to the higher fertility of the previous generation. Families had accepted the two-child

ideal family size that was promoted by family planning organizations, but due to the patrilocal marriage system, women who had no sons after the births of two girls were conflicted over giving birth again (Brunson 2016).

The vignettes in this chapter come from multiple periods of research spanning over a decade in this single community. Nepal contains a surprising amount of ethnic and linguistic diversity for its small size, and this study is limited to a cultural subgroup, Parbatiya Hindus. This group includes Bahun (or Brahman), Chhettri, Thakuri, and Dalit. The designation Parbatiya, or Hinducaste, is based on linguistic and historical distinctions, but ultimately it is a loose approximation of a cultural group that is heterogeneous because of the subgroups (often glossed as "castes") that comprise it and the increasingly porous boundaries that demarcate it. The vignettes that follow come primarily from 28 case studies with married women of varied caste, wealth, and household statuses, that I followed during 13 months of fieldwork during 2003–2005, with follow-up visits in 2009 and 2010. During the discussion of respectful maternity care, I also include the story of a woman from a period of fieldwork in 2015. The following quote eloquently captures the essence and strength of such long-term ethnographic research:

Repeatedly returning, one begins to grasp what happens in the meantime – the events and practices that enable wider social and political change, alongside those that debilitate societies and individuals, dooming them to stasis and intractability. In such returns, entanglements and intricacies are revealed. We witness the very temporality of politics, technology, money, and survival. The ethnographer demarcates previously uncharted landscapes and tracks people moving through them. By addressing complicated transformations of institutions and lives in contexts of adversity, ethnography is uniquely qualified to confront and humanize the ways problems and policies are framed and interventions carried out. (Biehl 2007:47)

This chapter aims to bring into conversation micro-level interviews, national level data, and even global manifestos and models. Between 2016 and 2030, as part of the Sustainable Development Goals, the target is to reduce the global maternal mortality ratio to less than 70 per

333

334

335

336

337

338

339

340

341

342

343

344

345

346

347

348

349

350

351

352

353

354

355

356

357

358 359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

100,000 live births (WHO 2016). What are some of the significant obstacles to achieving this in low-income countries such as Nepal, and what can demography contribute?

10.3 Gendered Dynamics of Power at the Societal and Familial Levels

One of the major impediments to improving maternal health statistics further in low-income countries is that at the societal and familial levels. maternal health is fraught with deeply ingrained gendered power dynamics. For this reason, in fact, maternal mortality rates are considered to be a good approximation of not only levels of gender equity in a society, but of societal development itself. In Nepal, much research has been devoted to uncovering some of the ways that gendered power dynamics systematically operate at the familial or household level. Maternal and child nutrition, for example, have been largely shaped by unspoken gender rules regarding who eats first in a family and who receives choice foods such as meat or even lentils (Gittelsohn et al. 1997; Messer 1997). Prenatal nutrition and care is another good example; Nepali women may not be able to modify their diets or subsistence labor during pregnancy (Panter-Brick 1989; Brunson 2018). The gendered norms operating in Nepal are particularly complex, as they vary with other social statuses such as caste and wealth (Cameron 1998; Brunson 2016) and ethnicity (March 2002). With this as the backdrop, a portion of my previous research focused on the gendered dynamics of decision making during obstetric emergencies at home, part of the "first delay" in Thaddeus and Maine's three delays model.

Women in my case studies generally were socialized to remain quiet or speak modestly about their suffering, and it was men who made decisions such as determining at what point a situation was dangerous or life-threatening enough that it warranted being taken to the hospital. The way in which a young, high-caste mother in her 20s, Anjala, told the story of the complica-

tions that occurred after she went into labor and the actions that were taken provide insight into the different roles family members act out in such scenarios.

377

378

379

380

381

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

392

393

394

395

396

397

398

399

400

401

402

403

404

405

407

408

409

410

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

420

421

422

423

424

Anjala was the daughter-in-law of a multigenerational family living in a large, three-story cement home perched on a higher portion of the mountainside community. She reported that she was particularly well cared for by her parents-inlaw, evidenced by her mother-in-law assisting with her more laborious chores, such as gathering fodder, and taking her to antenatal appointments at the teaching hospital. Anjala went into labor on a Friday evening but refused to go to the hospital initially, and continued to refuse even after being in labor for more than 24 h without discernible progress. During the interview, she made a point of saying that twice she rejected the admonitions of her husband's elder brother to go to the hospital, and then finally she gave into the reprimands of her husband's family. At another point in the interview just after this story, she claimed that the labor pain was not that bad - she had "slight stomach pain." She minimized her role and her agency in this situation in order to follow the social script of being a good woman and daughterin-law. She did not want to appear to be demanding, even in her act of telling the story with only me and my research assistant present. Often women would break from the script of being a good woman when they were talking with only other women present; they would subvert dominant gender scripts through humor or sarcasm. But Anjala stayed on script. After her vacuumassisted birth at the hospital, she lost much blood and fluids, and she remained there for 4 days on an intravenous solution. I will return to Anjala's story in the next section's discussion of respectful maternity care, offering additional information that may have influenced her initial refusal to go to the hospital.

Even in instances where women do feel sufficiently knowledgeable and empowered to suggest transfer to a hospital, women are often in no condition to make that demand – they may be barely conscious during an obstetric emergency. Shanta delivered her second child at home. There was a lack of money at that time, she said, and

since she started to have labor pains around midnight, she thought, "Why give trouble to others in the night. I called to my mother-in-law just before she was born". She figured that there was no one to take her to the hospital in the middle of the night anyway, so why should she wake the other family members. The labor pain was not as bad as it was with her first birth, her son, and she gave birth "easily" to her daughter around five in the morning. Shanta said,

She was born easily, but the placenta did not fall easily. It did not come out for 2–3 h, so it became difficult to cut it. My daughter became so 'serious' and so did I. Different people were saying different things. Whom should I believe? I was 'serious' because of bleeding, I was in a dilemma... what to do? I fell unconscious for about twenty minutes. All the family members were weeping. They thought I was dying.

Shanta did not indicate how much time passed in this way, but she said that the family members called the village health worker. The midwife was able to pull out the placenta, but there was excessive bleeding. The village health worker recommended that she be taken to the hospital. Someone fetched a taxi, and they took her to the teaching hospital. She regained consciousness on the way to the hospital.

Shanta remarked that many women die when the placenta does not come out. Some old people, she reported, say that cow dung should be thrust in the mouth – others said hair – so that one would vomit. Some recommended using a small hoe, and Shanta winced in telling this, citing the possibility of tetanus. She had been trained as a volunteer village health worker, and she knew what should have been done in her situation according to a biomedical model – but she said she was unable to speak adequately at that time.

These two stories and other similar ones highlight the importance of male involvement in obstetric emergencies in this social context. Women are likely to be limited, for both social and physical reasons, in their ability to decide

and assert that their situation necessitates hospitalization during obstetric emergencies. Part of the breakdown in women giving birth with the assistance of a trained professional, and in women being hospitalized in a timely fashion during an obstetric emergency, may result from a combination of factors. Birth is considered a natural event that does not warrant much special attention. Older women told stories of giving birth alone during the night or on the way home from the fields. In the past, a female relative would help a woman during delivery. Birth was both the domain and responsibility of women. With the advent of hospital deliveries and availability of trained health professionals to assist with birth, obtaining such care began to involve the decision-making power and the initiative to act that was in the hands of the men in the family. But men have not been knowledgeable about birth in the past, and may not even be alerted that it is happening.

In a much different setting in Nepal, Mullany's research with couples delivering in the major public hospital in urban Kathmandu revealed that a key obstacle to Nepali husbands' involvement in antenatal care and deliveries was their lack of knowledge regarding women's maternal health, along with social stigma and shyness or embarrassment. Mullany concluded, "Appealing to men as 'responsible partners' whose help is needed to reach the endpoint of 'healthy families' may, for example, provide an effective approach for targeting men in the Nepal setting" (Mullany 2006:2808). Young men and health providers alike in her study stated that young men (in this setting) were ready to be more involved with maternal health, but they needed education and either the will to ignore the social stigma attached

⁴Carolyn Sargent made a similar point about the medicalization of birth among the Bariba of Benin: she took the argument a step further by concluding that women's reproductive choices were being limited by the encouragement of hospital-based births by handing control over obstetric care to men.

509

510

511

512

513

514

515

516

517

518

519

520

521

522

523

524

525

526

527

528

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

536

537

538

539

540

541

542

543

544

545

546

547

to helping one's wife or programs aimed at changing such stigma.

10.4 Respectful Maternity Care

Another major impediment to improving maternal health statistics further in low-income countries is providing skilled assistance at birth and a referral system for obstetric emergencies without importing the harmful cultural artifacts of the history of gynecological practice in the United States. While many biomedical advances save women's lives during obstetric emergencies, through managing obstructed labor, hemorrhaging, eclampsia, and postpartum infection, the history of the medicalization of birth and the rise of obstetrics contains many troublesome chapters, including the professionalization of delivering normal births and the outlawing of midwifery, the use of iatrogenic medicinal and technological interventions in birth, and the failure to recognize the importance of the social or environmental aspects of a successful birth such as physical and emotional support for the laboring woman (Bell 2009; Cheyney 2010; Davis-Floyd et al. 2009).

One of the appeals of the referral system, and, as a result, the three delays model, is that it begins with the assumption that women will want or need to give birth at home or a nearby birthing center, the first level of maternity care in the referral system. This is an important starting point ideologically for scholars and practitioners critical of the medicalization of childbirth and the history of interventionist gynecology in the United States, but also pragmatically for low-income countries where sufficient infrastructure and personnel do not exist for universal institutionalized birth.

Global health scholars recently coined catchy phrases to describe the two extremes of approaches to obstetric care that should be avoided: "too much too soon" (TMTS) and "too little too late" (TLTL). Too much too soon

describes the routine over-medicalization of normal pregnancy and birth. It includes the unnecessary use of non-evidence-based interventions, as well as the use of interventions that are life saving when used appropriately, but harmful when applied routinely or overused. As institutional births increase, TMTS causes harm and increases health costs unnecessarily, and often concentrates disrespect and abuse. Too little too late, on the other hand, describes maternal health care with inadequate resources, below evidence-based standards, or care withheld or unavailable until too late to help (Miller et al. 2016). TLTL characterizes the situation in rural areas of low-income countries, while TMTS may characterize some women's experiences in an urban center of one of those same countries.

548

549

550

551

552

553

554

555

556

557

559

560

561

562

563

564

565

566

567

568

569

570

571

572

573

574

575

576

577

578

579

580

581

582

583

584

585

586

587

588

589

590

If one of the fundamental goals of global maternal health programs is for every birth to be attended by a skilled professional (de Bernis et al. 2003), whether at home or in an institution, then the relations between that skilled professional and the birthing woman are of utmost importance. In recent years a surge in interest in respectful maternity care has been building, drawing increasing attention to the treatment of birthing women by practitioners. Anthropologists have documented how birthing women may be abused verbally or even physically in hospital settings (Dixon 2015; Smith-Oka 2012, 2015), particularly when a large gap in social standing (due to gender, profession, wealth, education, or ethnicity) exists between practitioner and patient. These scholars reveal the deeper patterns of social inequality and violence that play out in hospital delivery rooms.

In Nepal's highly stratified society, service provider attitudes and behaviors have been reported to affect healthcare utilization by women, specifically issues such as patronage and negative attitudes (Clapham et al. 2008; Suvedi et al. 2009). Women's perceptions of staff attitudes, along with the availability of equipment and drugs, were found to have an effect in Kaski,

642

643

644

645

646

647

648

649

650

651

652

653

654

655

656

657

658

659

660

661

662

663

664

665

666

667

668

669

670

671

672

673

674

675

676

677

678

679

680

681

682

683

684

685

686

687

a district in the central hills of Nepal (Karkee et al. 2015). In that study, women bypassed their nearest birth centers because they perceived lower-level facilities to have limited equipment and competent staff to deal with birth complications. Over-crowding in hospitals is an ongoing problem due to such widespread perspectives.

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

599

600

601

602

603

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

621

622

623

624

625

626

627

628

629

630

631

632

633

634

635

636

637

638

639

While most women in my research did not speak poorly of the hospitals or treatment they received there, a couple of women had minor complaints about the long lines and wait time and the attitudes of the nurses or doctors. One woman's experience, however, was harrowing. Shanta gave birth to her eldest child, a son, at the teaching hospital. The nurses showed her son to her, but then later another nurse picked up her baby and handed him to another woman who also had given birth. Shanta had heard of such a thing happening before, and so she was worried and was keeping watch over her son despite feeling weak. She said, "A woman near my bed had given birth to a daughter. That woman was claiming my son, saying this child is mine. Of course, she was unaware of the switch. I got up and said, 'That is my baby.' I scolded that nurse. My son would have been exchanged if I had not taken care! That woman also could have taken my son because she already had four daughters." This near swapping of infants occurred after she had already experienced another mishap. She had needed stitches after giving birth, and the nurses who were working on her were students at the teaching hospital. She needed six stitches, but some of the stitches were so crooked that the senior nurse scolded the student nurses when she saw their work. She ordered them to repeat the process. After the senior nurse left, the student "stitched it her own way," according to Shanta, and it started to bleed. Such experiences, even if they are rare, do not build confidence in hospital deliveries amongst women or their families.

In Anjala's case described in the previous section, another potential reason for delaying going to the hospital also deserves consideration: Anjala might have wanted to avoid the hospital. She commented on how, during her antenatal appointments, the "nurses used to scold me and say, 'Why is such a small girl going to give birth

so early?". Then she laughed, explaining that they must have thought that she was young, when in fact she was 22 at the time of her first birth, because she happened to be very petite and looked younger than her age. This (misguided) admonishment by the nurses hints at the possibility of mistreatment by hospital staff, however in this particular case she reported that her experiences at the hospitals were good. Anjala did not indicate that this was the reason she did not want to give birth in the hospital during her delayed labor described in the previous section; I simply suggest that such moralizing on the part of nurses might be part of the broader context of why one might want to avoid the hospital.

The final vignette that I wish to use to illustrate one of the challenges to further reducing maternal mortality ratios in low-income countries comes from an interview with an economically and socially vulnerable woman who had lost her home in the 2015 Nepal earthquakes. She had four young children, but her husband was typically not around. He came and went in irregular intervals, often gone for days at a time, and she did not seem to miss his presence since when he was there he was often violent. She was in late-stage pregnancy, by her best estimation, and was due any time. Looking around at her young children and her lack of other family members to assist her with the birth, I inquired whether she intended to utilize the health post birth center. She replied no, that one of the neighbor women might help if there was any trouble. Given my past experience of gathering stories of similar women in this community giving birth unassisted and alone (Brunson 2010), it was hard for me to believe her more affluent neighbors would come to her aid in a timely fashion and be qualified to make decisions about her welfare. Her level of impoverishment and abandonment contrasted sharply to the significantly more comfortable lives of her neighbors.

The next day after interviewing her, I visited the new local health post a few kilometers down the mountainside from her home. The concrete building and paint still looked new, and the medical equipment was shiny. The nurses gave me a tour of the new facility, including an empty labor-

689

690

691

692

693

694

695

696

697

698

699

700

701

702

703

704

705

706

707

708

709

710

711

712

713 714

715

716

717

718

719

720

721

722

723

724

725

726

727

728

729

ing room and delivery room. In the delivery room, center stage, was a hard table with stirrups attached to spindly metal mechanisms holding them at the ready. It was hard to imagine the woman being able to navigate such a setting without fear and discomfort when confronted by such an uninviting contraption and the unfamiliar expectations of the medical staff about how she ought to comport her body during birth. If she perished in childbirth at home, I doubt her death would be entered into any registry. Her poverty and her lack of support rendered her invisible.

Considerations 10.5 for the Future

10.5.1 The Utility and Limitations of an Obstetric Transition Model

The recent development of an obstetric transition model to explain the varying causes for maternal mortality at different "stages" is worth considering in relation to the themes I identified in this chapter as ongoing challenges to achieving improvements in maternal health. The obstetric transition model is a theoretical framework that attempts to explain gradual changes that countries experience as they eliminate what is labeled avoidable maternal mortality. The broad, worldwide pattern that the model documents includes the following: a shift from maternal deaths predominantly due direct obstetric causes to deaths due to indirect causes; from deaths due to communicable diseases to deaths caused by noncommunicable diseases; from a younger maternal population to an older one; and a decrease in maternal mortality ratio (MMR), along with an increase in institutionalized maternity care, and eventually over-medicalization (Souza et al. 2014).

There are five stages in the model, ranging from stage 1 in which the MMR is greater than 1000 and women do not receive professional obstetric care, to stage 5 in which the MMR is

less than 5 and indirect obstetric causes associated with chronic-degenerative diseases are the main obstacles. In stage 5, one of the main challenges is managing vulnerable populations. Nepal fits in stage 3 of the model, which is characterized as follows:

730

731

732

733

734

735

736

737

738

739

740

741

742

743

744

745

746

747

748

749

750

751

752

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

760

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773

774

775

776

777

Stage 3 (MMR: 299-50 maternal death/100,000 live births): Fertility is variable and direct causes of mortality still predominate. This is a complex stage, because access continues to be an issue for a large part of the population. However, since a high proportion of pregnant women arrive at health services, quality of care is one of the main determinants of health outcomes, particularly related to overburdened health services. Primary prevention, as well as secondary and tertiary prevention, is fundamental to improve maternal health outcomes in this stage. In other words, the quality of care, skilled childbirth care and adequate management of complications are essential for the reduction in maternal mortality. (Souza et al. 2014)

In the next stage, stage 4, an aspect that emerges is the increasing role of medicalization as a threat to the quality and improvement of health outcomes. This is what I argue is on the horizon for women in Nepal, but I am optimistic that countries like Nepal can learn from the mistakes of over-medicalization in mid- and highincome countries and health practitioners can actively work to avoid this.

The strength of the obstetric transition model is that it clearly differentiates and demarcates what the burden of disease is likely to be at the national level in various countries around the globe. It serves as an excellent reminder that the causes and contexts of maternal health differ dramatically depending on whether one is considering a lowincome country or a high-income one. The limitations and drawbacks of such a model are the ways in which it obscures the variation that one would find within a single nation such as Nepal, in which the urban elite have much better access to high quality care during pregnancy and birth (not to mention nutritious food, clean water, etc.), while the rural poor may have to travel hours by foot to reach the nearest low-level birthing center. Such a model, then, has the potential to erase the effects of abject poverty and the inequitable distribution

of resources within a society on women's lives. Pockets of society in the United States, for example, still experience the same causes of maternal mortality that predominate in a low-income country. Instead of smoothing over such pockets of vulnerable populations in order to focus on the greater national-level trends, those pockets need to be discovered and targeted. By placing all nations onto a single, linear model, according to stage of development, the obstetric transition model repeats some of the mistakes of the demographic transition model. It flattens the contours of social life that shape maternal health outcomes, and it is tinged with the assumptions of modernization theory. There is much to learn from the model, however, and its utility should be exploited while, at the same time, disallowing it to become yet another totalizing and monolithic model of population or health transitions.

778

779

780

781

782

783

784

785

786

787

788

789

790

791

792 793

794

795

796

797

798

799

800

801

802

803

804

805

806

807

808

809

810

811

812

813

814

815

816

817

818

10.5.2 A Manifesto for Maternal Health Post-2015

The manifesto for maternal health (Langer et al. 2013) created at the Global Maternal Health Conference in Arusha aspired to look ahead to the post-MDG world, post 2015, and identify the critical areas for continued efforts to improve global maternal health. Its list of goals includes the themes I identified in this chapter. Point 4, for example, highlights the importance of gender disparities and poverty in determining the care that women receive. Point 7 of the manifesto states that respectful maternity care for all women is an ethical imperative. And point 6 echoes my conclusion about the pregnant woman who did not want antenatal care or to deliver her child at the local health post. It reads,

A much greater emphasis must be put on reaching the unseen women who are socially excluded because of culture, geography, education, disabilities, and other driving forces of invisibility. If we are serious about redressing gender and access inequities, we have to ask fundamental and difficult questions about the nature of our societies and the value, or sometimes lack of value, we ascribe to individuals, especially women, in those societies.

In addition, one of the points in the manifesto clearly identifies a need that could be filled by the expertise, skills, and methods of demographers. Point 10 states,

A critical gap that threatens the future health of women and mothers is the catastrophic failure to have reliable information on maternal deaths and health outcomes within and across countries. This gap in measurement, information, and accountability must be a priority now and post-2015.

10.6 Conclusion

As concerns over a global population explosion wane among policy makers, funding agencies, and demographers alike, the tremendous amount of effort devoted to research on fertility – at least in terms of limiting fertility - can ease. This opens up space for demographic research to focus not merely on gender and population increase or decrease, but gender and the conditions of reproduction. Just as in studies of gender and migration, demographers are not only interested in the sum of who is moving, they are interested in the quality of life of those individuals, the challenges they face, and the challenges that governments face in hosting them. Demographers in a discipline that has traditionally been focused on fertility rates now have the latitude to expand their expertise to other aspects of fertility, including maternal and infant health. This is not to say that demographers have not played a critical role in researching and contributing to such issues prior to this point; indeed, many have. Rather, I argue that topics such as maternal health no longer need to be located on the periphery of demography's concerns and priorities. Demography has the ability (methodologically and analytically)

822823824825

826

819

820

821

833

834

835

836

837

838

839

840

841

842

843

844

845

846

847

848

849

850

851

852

853

854

855

856

857

858

859

8765

and the expertise to reveal at the population level who suffers and who does not in matters of reproduction, and to theorize why. Future scholarship can focus on the importance of health and educated individuals for strengthening economies and communities, rather than being consumed by the drive to lower fertility rates. Instead of convincing low-income countries that the future of their economic health is tied to curbing population growth, perhaps a new proclamation for governments can be that the health and education of men and women is necessary for the future health of communities and economic growth.

Instead of making women count primarily through calculations of fertility rates and maternal mortality rates, the scope of demographic inquiry can be widened to include a better balance of research on topics such as antenatal and postnatal health. Maternal deaths, for example, typically estimated by dividing by the number of live births to create a ratio that can be compared across varying population sizes, has been used as the standard global health indicator for measuring maternal health. There is some irony to the use of this metric to measure maternal health; it is as if not dying because of childbirth indicates satisfactory maternal health. This indicator cannot capture the morbidity of women who do not die, but who may experience severe morbidity and loss of productivity instead. Overcoming the shortcomings of this indicator requires a shift in focus from maternal mortality to maternal morbidity, the major and minor health problems women endure as a result of pregnancy and childbirth (Brunson 2018). Recently leaders in the field of maternal health in developing countries have made an additional argument for this shift in focus to morbidity, based in the logic that as global maternal mortality declines, or as the perceived crisis of women dying in childbirth subsides, resources and energy can be directed toward "health, productivity, and dignity" (Langer et al. 2013) instead of a triage approach. And with respect to fertility, Marcia Inhorn and others have issued similar calls for studies of

infertility in low-income countries (Inhorn and Van Balen 2002; also see Wilson 2014 for the United States), a topic that historically had been ignored in stark contrast to the abundance of research on contraceptive uptake and limiting fertility.

In this way, demography need not reinvent the wheel. Some scholars have been researching these issues in the global South for decades but on a different scale, conducting community studies or household studies. Scholars in global health and anthropology are already calling for these shifts and laying the groundwork at the edges of demography, engaging in innovative work on metrics, for example (Adams 2016; Adams et al. 2015). I hope that demographers will join us in those fertile interdisciplinary interstices.

References

Adams, V. (Ed.). (2016). *Metrics: What counts in global health*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Adams, V., Craig, S. R., & Samen, A. (2015). Alternative accounting in maternal and infant global health. *Global Public Health*, 11(3), 276–294. https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2015.1021364.

Alkema, L., Chou, D., Hogan, D., Zhang, S., Moller, A.-B., Gemmill, A.,... Say, L. (2015). Global, regional, and national levels and trends in maternal mortality between 1990 and 2015, with scenario-based projections to 2030: A systematic analysis by the UN maternal mortality estimation inter-agency group. *The Lancet*, 387(10017), 462–474. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(15)00838-7.

Bell, S. (2009). DES daughters: Embodied knowledge and the transformation of women's health politics. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Biehl, J. (2007). Will to live: AIDS therapies and the politics of survival. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
Brunson, J. (2010). Confronting maternal mortality, controlling birth in Nepal: The gendered politics of receiving biomedical care at birth. Social Science and Medicine, 71(10), 1719–1727.

Brunson, J. (2016). *Planning families in Nepal: Global and local projects of reproduction*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.

Brunson, J. (2018). Concealed pregnancies and protected postpartum periods: Critical junctures in promoting maternal health in Nepal. Manuscript submitted for publication.

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1020

1021

1022

1023

1024

1025

1026

1027

1028

1029

1030

1031

1032

1033

1034

1035

1036

1037

1038

1039

1040

1041

1042

1043

1044

1045

1046

1047

1048

1049

1050

1051

1052

1053

1054

1055

1056

1057

1058

1059

1060

1061

1062

1063

1064

1065

1066

1067

1068

1069

1070

953 Cameron, M. M. (1998). On the edge of the auspicious:
 954 Gender and caste in Nepal. Chicago: University of
 955 Illinois Press.

956

957

958

959

960

961

962

963

964

965

966

967

968

969

970

971

972

973

974

975

976

977

978

979

980

981

982

983

984

985

986 987

988

989

990

991

992

993

994

995

996

997

998

999

1000

1001

1002

1006

1007

1008

1009

- Cheyney, M. (2010). Born at home: The biological, cultural, and political dimensions of maternity care in the United States. Belmont: Wadsworth.
- Clapham, S., Pokharel, D., Bird, C., & Basnett, I. (2008). Addressing the attitudes of service providers: Increasing access to professional midwifery care in Nepal. *Tropical Doctor*, 38(4), 197–201. https://doi.org/10.1258/td.2008.070291.
- Davis-Floyd, R., Barclay, L., Tritten, J., & Daviss, B.-A. (2009). Birth models that work. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- de Bernis, L., Sherratt, D. R., AbouZahr, C., & Van Lerberghe, W. (2003). Skilled attendants for pregnancy, childbirth and postnatal care. *British Medical Bulletin*, 67, 39–57.
- Dixon, L. Z. (2015). Obstetrics in a time of violence: Mexican midwives critique routine hospital practices. Medical Anthropology Quarterly, 29(4), 437–454. https://doi.org/10.1111/maq.12174.
- Firoz, T., Ateka-Barrutia, O., Rojas-Suarez, J. A., Wijeyaratne, C., Castillo, E., Lombaard, H., & Magee, L. A. (2015). Global obstetric medicine: Collaborating towards global progress in maternal health. *Obstetric Medicine*, 8(3), 138–145. https://doi.org/10.1177/175 3495X15595308.
- Gittelsohn, J., Thapa, M., & Landman, L. T. (1997). Cultural factors, caloric intake and micronutrient sufficiency in rural Nepali households. *Social Science & Medicine*, 44(11), 1739–1749. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-9536(96)00375-9.
- Hussein, J., & Clapham, S. (2005). Message in a bottle: Sinking in a sea of safe motherhood concepts. *Health Policy*, 73(3), 294–302. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.healthpol.2004.11.021.
- Hussein, J., Bell, J., Dar Iang, M., Mesko, N., Amery, J., & Graham, W. (2011). An appraisal of the maternal mortality decline in Nepal. *PLoS One*, 6(5), e19898. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0019898.
- Hussein, J., Kanguru, L., Astin, M., & Munjanja, S. (2012). The effectiveness of emergency obstetric referral interventions in developing country settings: A systematic review. *PLoS Medicine*, 9(7), e1001264. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1001264.
- Inhorn, M., & Van Balen, F. (2002). Infertility around the globe: New thinking on childlessness, gender, and reproductive technologies. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Justice, J. (1989). *Policies, plans, and people*. Berkeley:
 University of California Press.
 Karkee, R., Lee, A. H., & Binns, C. W. (2015). Bypassing
 - Karkee, R., Lee, A. H., & Binns, C. W. (2015). Bypassing birth centres for childbirth: An analysis of data from a community-based prospective cohort study in Nepal. *Health Policy and Planning*, 30(1), 1–7. https://doi. org/10.1093/heapol/czt090.
- 1010 Kertzer, D. I., & Fricke, T. (1997). Toward an anthro-1011 pological demography. In D. I. Kertzer & T. Fricke

- (Eds.), Anthropological demography (pp. 1–35). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Langer, A., Horton, R., & Chalamilla, G. (2013).
 A manifesto for maternal health post-2015. *The Lancet*, 381(9867), 601–602. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(13)60259-7.
- March, K. (2002). "If each comes halfway": Meeting tamang women in Nepal. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Messer, E. (1997). Intra-household allocation of food and health care: Current findings and understandings—Introduction. Social Science & Medicine, 44(11), 1675–1684. https://doi.org/10.1016/ S0277-9536(96)00370-X.
- Miller, S., Abalos, E., Chamillard, M., Ciapponi, A., Colaci, D., Comandé, D.,... Althabe, F. (2016). Beyond too little, too late and too much, too soon: A pathway towards evidence-based, respectful maternity care worldwide. *The Lancet*, 388(10056), 2176–2192. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(16)31472-6.
- Ministry of Health MOH/Nepal, New ERA/Nepal, & ICF. (2017). Nepal demographic and health survey 2016. Retrieved from Kathmandu, Nepal: http://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR336/FR336.pdf.
- Mullany, B. C. (2006). Barriers to and attitudes towards promoting husbands' involvement in maternal health in Katmandu, Nepal. Social Science & Medicine, 62(11), 2798–2809.
- Panter-Brick, C. (1989). Motherhood and subsistence work: The Tamang of rural Nepal. *Human Ecology*, 17(2), 205–228.
- Rath, A. D., Basnett, I., Cole, M., Subedi, H. N., Thomas, D., & Murray, S. F. (2007). Improving emergency obstetric care in a context of very high maternal mortality: The Nepal safer motherhood project 1997–2004. Reproductive Health Matters, 15(30), 72–80.
- Raynes-Greenow, C. (2017). Gaps and challenges underpinning the first analysis of global coverage of early antenatal care. *The Lancet Global Health*, 5(10), e949–e950. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/ S2214-109X(17)30346-7.
- Riley, N., & McCarthy, J. (2003). Demography in the age of the postmodern. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rosenfield, A., & Maine, D. (1985). Maternal mortality A neglected tragedy: Where is the M in MCH? *The Lancet*, 326(8446), 83–85. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(85)90188-6.
- Rosenfield, A., Min, C. J., & Freedman, L. P. (2007). Making motherhood safe in developing countries. *New England Journal of Medicine*, *356*(14), 1395–1397. https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMp078026.
- Scheper-Hughes, N. (1997). Demography without numbers. In D. I. Kertzer & T. Fricke (Eds.), Anthropological demography. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Smith-Oka, V. (2012). Bodies of risk: Constructing motherhood in a Mexican Public Hospital. Social Science and Medicine, 75(12), 2275–2282.

- 1076 1077 1078 1079 1080
- doi:https://doi.org/10.1111/1471-0528.12735. Suvedi, B. K., Pradhan, A., Barnett, S., Puri, M., Chritrikar, S. R., Poudel, P.,... Hulton, L. (2009). Nepal maternal mortality and morbidity study 2008/2009: Summar of preliminary findings. Retrieved from Kathmandu

Smith-Oka, V. (2015). Microaggressions and the repro-

M., Oladapo, O. T.,... Temmerman, M. (2014).

Obstetric transition: The pathway towards ending

preventable maternal deaths. BJOG: An International

Journal of Obstetrics & Gynaecology, 121, 1-4.

Thaddeus, S., & Maine, D. (1994). Too far to walk: Maternal mortality in context. Social Science Medicine. 38(8), 1091–1110. https://doi. org/10.1016/0277-9536(94)90226-7.

1086

1087

1088

1089

1090

1091

1092

1093

1094

1095

1096

1097

1098

1099

1100

1101

- UNFPA, UNICEF, Bank, T. W., WHO, IPPF, & Council, T. P. (1997). The safe motherhood action agenda: Priorities for the next decade. Retrieved from http://documents. worldbank.org/curated/en/403701468764711167/Thesafe-motherhood-action-agenda-priorities-for-the-nextdecade
- WHO. (2016). Maternal mortality fact sheet. Retrieved http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/ from fs348/en/
- Wilson, K. (2014). Not trying: Infertility, childlessness, and ambivalence. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press.